

These notes reference the spreadsheet “Equality Transparency - Table 2 and Table A2.xlsx.”

Explanation of Table 2: In the spreadsheet, each pair of rows lists coefficient estimates for the scaled outcome variables for the “White” and “All other” samples from JAMES NONNEMAKER ET AL., EXPERIMENTAL STUDY OF GRAPHIC CIGARETTE WARNING LABELS app. C-2 at 106-18, 248-60, 308-20 (2010), <https://www.regulations.gov/document/FDA-2010-N-0568-0008>. For instance, for the “Hole in Throat” image and the Adult and Young-Adult Respondents, the coefficient estimate for the “emotional reaction scale” outcome variable for the “White” sample, with the associated indicator for the level of statistical significance, was 5.664***, as shown on p. 308 of this source. In this source, * indicates statistical significance at the 0.05 level, ** indicates statistical significance at the 0.01 level, and *** indicates statistical significance at the 0.001 level; by contrast, this paper uses the standard notation under which ** indicates statistical significance at the 0.05 level and *** indicates statistical significance at the 0.01 level (which includes, as a subset, statistical significance at the 0.001 level).

For the “emotional reaction scale” outcome variable in the spreadsheet, the number of green boxes, showing coefficient estimate pairs for which there was a positive effect for the “White” sample and no effect for the “All other” sample, in rows 6-12 and 14-20 of the spreadsheet is equal to the numerator (2) in the upper left-hand table entry. (As in the paper, a positive effect means that a coefficient estimate is positive and different from 0 by a statistically significant margin; no effect means that a coefficient estimate is not different from 0 by a statistically significant margin; and a negative effect means that a coefficient estimate is negative and different from 0 by a statistically significant margin.) For the “emotional reaction scale” outcome variable, the total number of coefficient estimate pairs in rows 6-12 and 14-20 of the spreadsheet is equal to the denominator (6) in the upper left-hand table entry. The same descriptions apply to the numerators and denominators of the middle left-hand table entry (spreadsheet rows 30-66 and 68-104) and the bottom left-hand table entry (spreadsheet rows 144-174 and 176-206).

For all outcome variables in the spreadsheet, the number of green boxes in rows 6-12 and 14-20 is equal to the numerator (4) in the upper right-hand table entry, and the total number of coefficient estimate pairs in these rows is equal to the denominator (23) in this entry. The same descriptions apply to the numerators and denominators of the middle right-hand table entry (spreadsheet rows 30-66 and 68-104) and the bottom right-hand table entry (spreadsheet rows 144-174 and 176-206).

Explanation of Table A2. For the “emotional reaction scale” outcome variable in the spreadsheet and the Adult and Young-Adult Respondents, the number of green boxes in rows 6-12 of the spreadsheet is equal to the numerator (1) in the upper left-hand table entry. For this outcome variable and these respondents, the total number of coefficient estimate pairs in rows 6-12 of the spreadsheet is equal to the denominator (3) in the upper left-hand table entry. The same descriptions apply to the numerators and denominators of the middle left-hand table entry (spreadsheet rows 30-66) and the bottom left-hand table entry (spreadsheet rows 144-174).

For the “emotional reaction scale” outcome variable in the spreadsheet and the Youth Respondents, the same descriptions apply (spreadsheet rows 14-20, 68-104, and 176-206 for the upper, middle, and bottom left-hand table entries respectively). For this outcome variable in the spreadsheet and the Adult Respondents, the same descriptions apply as well (spreadsheet rows 22-28, 106-142, and 208-238 for the upper, middle, and bottom left-hand table entries respectively).

For all outcome variables in the spreadsheet and the Adult and Young-Adult Respondents, the number of green boxes in rows 6-12 is equal to the numerator (3) in the upper left-hand table entry, and the total number of coefficient estimate pairs in these rows is equal to the denominator (12) in this entry. The same descriptions apply to the numerators and denominators of the middle right-hand table entry (spreadsheet rows 30-66) and the bottom right-hand table entry (spreadsheet rows 144-174).

For all outcome variables in the spreadsheet and the Youth Respondents, the same descriptions apply (spreadsheet rows 14-20, 68-104, and 176-206 for the upper, middle, and bottom right-hand table entries respectively). For these outcome variables in the spreadsheet and the Adult Respondents, the same descriptions apply as well (spreadsheet rows 22-28, 106-142, and 208-238 for the upper, middle, and bottom right-hand table entries respectively).