Oxford Statement on the International Law Protections against Cyber Operations Targeting the Health-Care Sector

May 2020

We, the undersigned public international lawyers, have watched with growing concern reports of cyber incidents targeting medical facilities around the world, many of which are directly involved in responding to the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic.

We are concerned that the impact of such incidents is exacerbated by the existing vulnerability of the health-care sector to cyber harm. Even in ordinary times, this sector is particularly vulnerable to cyber threats due to its growing digital dependency and attack surface.

We consider it essential that medical facilities around the world function without disruption as they struggle to respond to the COVID-19 pandemic. Any interference with the provision of health-care, including by cyber means, risks further loss of life as thousands continue to die every day.

We support the International Committee of the Red Cross’ call on States to protect medical services and medical facilities from harmful cyber operations of any kind.

We emphasize that cyber operations do not occur in a normative void or a law-free zone. As recognized by the United Nations General Assembly, international law, and in particular the Charter of the United Nations, is applicable and essential to maintaining peace and stability and promoting an open, secure, stable, accessible and peaceful information and communications technology environment.

Guided by these considerations, we agree that the following rules and principles of international law protect medical facilities against harmful cyber operations. We encourage all States to consider these rules and principles when developing national positions as well as in the relevant multilateral processes and deliberations:
Oxford Statement on the International Law Protections against Cyber Operations Targeting the Health-Care Sector

1. International law applies to cyber operations by States, including those that target the health-care sector.

2. International law prohibits cyber operations by States that have serious adverse consequences for essential medical services in other States.

3. International human rights law requires States to respect and to ensure the right to life and the right to health of all persons within their jurisdiction, including through taking measures to prevent third parties from interfering with these rights by cyber means.

4. When a State is or should be aware of a cyber operation that emanates from its territory or infrastructure under its jurisdiction or control, and which will produce adverse consequences for health-care facilities abroad, the State must take all feasible measures to prevent or stop the operation, and to mitigate any harms threatened or generated by the operation.

5. During armed conflict, international humanitarian law requires that medical units, transport and personnel must be respected and protected at all times. Accordingly, parties to armed conflicts: must not disrupt the functioning of health-care facilities through cyber operations; must take all feasible precautions to avoid incidental harm caused by cyber operations, and; must take all feasible measures to facilitate the functioning of health-care facilities and to prevent their being harmed, including by cyber operations.

6. Cyber operations against medical facilities will amount to international crimes, if they fulfil the specific elements of these crimes, including war crimes and crimes against humanity.

7. The application of the aforementioned rules of international law is without prejudice to any and all other applicable rules of international law that provide protections against harmful cyber operations.

The current list of signatories and their affiliations (for identification purposes only) is below.
Oxford Statement on the International Law Protections against Cyber Operations Targeting the Health-Care Sector

1) Dapo Akande, Professor of Public International Law, Co-Director, Oxford Institute for Ethics, Law & Armed Conflict (ELAC), University of Oxford
2) Daniel Álvarez-Valenzuela, Professor of Law, University of Chile School of Law, Academic Coordinator, Centre for Information Technology Law Studies (CEDI)
3) Diane Marie Amann, Emily & Ernest Woodruff Chair in International Law and Faculty Co-Director, University of Georgia School of Law
4) Catherine Amirfar, Partner, Debevoise & Plimpton LLP, former Counselor on International Law, U.S. State Department (2014-2016)
5) Mahnoush H. Arsanjani, Former Director, Codification Division, Office of Legal Affairs, United Nations
6) Aslı Bâli, Professor of Law, UCLA School of Law
7) Eyal Benvenisti, Whewell Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge, C C Ng Fellow, Jesus College, Director of the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law
8) Daniel Bodansky, Regents' Professor, Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law, Arizona State University
9) Russell Buchan, Senior Lecturer in International Law, University of Sheffield
10) Nicolás Carrillo-Santarelli, Associate Professor of International Law, La Sabana University, Colombia
11) Anthony E Cassimatis, Professor of Law, University of Queensland
12) Kalliopi Chainoglou, Assistant Professor of International Law and International institutions, Department of International and European Studies, University of Macedonia (Greece)
13) Lilian Chenwi, Professor of Law, University of the Witwatersrand School of Law
14) Alejandro Chehtman, Professor of International Law at Di Tella University, Argentina
15) Roger S. Clark, Board of Governors Professor, Rutgers Law School
16) Sarah H. Cleveland, Louis Henkin Professor of Human and Constitutional Rights, Columbia University Law School, Former Vice Chair, UN Human Rights Committee
17) Antonio Coco, Lecturer in Public International Law, University of Essex and Visiting Fellow at ELAC, University of Oxford
18) Rebecca Crootof, Assistant Professor of Law, University of Richmond School of Law
19) Federica D’Alessandra, Executive Director of the Oxford Programme on International Peace and Security, Blavatnik School of Government, University of Oxford
20) Lori Fisler Damrosch, Hamilton Fish Professor of International Law and Diplomacy, Columbia University Law School
Oxford Statement on the International Law Protections against Cyber Operations Targeting the Health-Care Sector

21) Tom Dannenbaum, Assistant Professor of International Law, The Fletcher School of Law & Diplomacy, Tufts  
22) Talita de Souza Dias, Postdoctoral Research Fellow, ELAC, University of Oxford  
23) François Delerue, Research Fellow in Cyberdefense and International Law at the Institut de Recherche stratégique de l’École militaire (IRSEM) and Adjunct Lecturer at Sciences Po, Paris, France  
24) Diane Desierto, Associate Professor of Human Rights Law and Global Affairs, Keough School of Global Affairs, University of Notre Dame  
25) William S. Dodge, Martin Luther King, Jr. Professor of Law and John D. Ayer Chair in Business Law, University of California, Davis, School of Law  
26) Brian Egan, Partner, Steptoe & Johnson LLP, Washington DC, former Legal Adviser, US Department of State, 2016-17  
27) Kristen Eichensehr, Assistant Professor of Law, UCLA Law School  
28) Itay Epshstein, Senior Humanitarian Law and Policy Consultant, Humanitarian Policy  
29) Eric Fripp, Barrister, Lamb Building, Temple EC4Y, London, UK; Senior Visiting Fellow, Refugee Law Initiative, School of Advanced Study, University of London  
30) Richard Goldstone, former Prosecutor International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia, former Judge Constitutional Court of South Africa  
31) Guy S. Goodwin-Gill, Professor of Law, University of New South Wales (UNSW), Andrew & Renata Kaldor Centre for International Refugee Law, UNSW, Emeritus Fellow, All Souls College, Oxford  
32) Claudio Grossman, Professor of Law, Dean Emeritus, American University Washington College of Law  
33) Oona A. Hathaway, Gerard C. and Bernice Latrobe Smith Professor of International Law, Counselor to the Dean, and Director of the Center for Global Legal Challenges, Yale Law School  
34) Kevin Jon Heller, Professor at Australian National University and Associate Professor of Public International Law at the University of Amsterdam  
35) Moshe Hirsch, Professor of International Law, Maria Von Hofmannsthal Chair in International Law, Faculty of Law & Department of International Relations, Hebrew University of Jerusalem  
36) Duncan B. Hollis, Laura H. Carnell Professor of Law, Temple University School of Law  
37) Zhixiong Huang, Professor of International Law & Vice Dean, Wuhan University School of Law, China  
38) Rebecca Ingber, Associate Professor of Law, Boston University School of Law (current); Professor of Law, Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law (as of July 1)
Oxford Statement on the International Law Protections against Cyber Operations Targeting the Health-Care Sector

39) Eric Talbot Jensen, Robert W. Barker Professor of Law, Brigham Young University
40) Derek Jinks, A.W. Walker Centennial Chair in Law, University of Texas School of Law
41) Stian Øby Johansen, Associate professor at the Centre for European Law at the University of Oslo
42) Kate Jones, Faculty of Law, University of Oxford
43) Ido Kilovaty, Assistant Professor of Law, University of Tulsa College of Law
44) Harold Hongju Koh, Sterling Professor of International Law, Yale Law School, Legal Adviser (2009-13) and Assistant Secretary for Democracy, Human Rights and Labor (1998-2001), US Department of State
45) Heike Krieger, Professor of International and Public Law, Freie Universität Berlin
46) Masahiro Kurosaki, Associate Professor of International Law and Director of the Study of Law, Security and Military Operations, National Defense Academy of Japan
47) O-Gon Kwon, President, Assembly of States Parties, International Criminal Court, former Judge and Vice President, International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia (Seoul, Republic of Korea)
48) Henning Lahmann, Digital Society Institute, ESMT Berlin, Germany
49) Eliav Lieblich, Senior Lecturer, Buchmann Faculty of Law, Tel Aviv University
50) Rain Liivoja, Associate Professor of Law, University of Queensland
51) Marco Longobardo, Lecturer in International Law, University of Westminster
52) Asaf Lubin, Affiliate, Berkman Klein Center for Internet and Society, Harvard University; Associate Professor, Indiana University Maurer School of Law (beginning Fall 2020)
53) Doreen Lustig, Senior Lecturer, Tel Aviv University Faculty of Law
54) Maurice Mendelson QC, Blackstone Chambers Barristers; Emeritus Professor of International Law in the University of London
55) Bonita Meyersfeld, Associate Professor of Law, University of the Witwatersrand, South Africa
56) Tomohiro Mikanagi, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Japan
57) Marko Milanovic, Professor of Public International Law, University of Nottingham School of Law
58) Samuel Moyn, Henry R. Luce Professor of Jurisprudence, Yale University
59) Harriet Moynihan, Senior Research Fellow, International Law Programme, Chatham House (Royal Institute of International Affairs)
60) Sean D. Murphy, Manatt/Ahn Professor of International Law, George Washington University Law School
61) James C. O’Brien, Vice Chair, Albright Stonebridge Group
Oxford Statement on the International Law Protections against Cyber Operations Targeting the Health-Care Sector

62) Phoebe Okowa, Professor of Public International Law, Queen Mary, University of London
63) Anne Peters, Director, Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law, Heidelberg, Germany
64) Mónica Pinto, Professor Emerita, Universidad de Buenos Aires, Facultad de Derecho, Argentina
65) Stephen Pomper, Senior Director for Policy, International Crisis Group; former U.S. State Department Assistant Legal Adviser for Political-Military Affairs
66) Michael Posner, Jerome Kohlberg Professor of Ethics and Finance, NYU Stern School of Business; Former Assistant Secretary of State for Democracy, Human Rights and Labor (2009-2013)
67) Steven R. Ratner, Bruno Simma Collegiate Professor of Law, University of Michigan Law School
68) Michael Reisman, Professor, Yale Law School
69) Przemysław Roguski, Lecturer in Law, Jagiellonian University in Kraków, Poland
70) Helene Ruiz-Fabri, Professor, Director of the Max Planck Institute Luxembourg for Procedural Law
71) Barrie Sander, Fellow, Fundação Getúlio Vargas, Brazil
72) Andrew Sanger, University Lecturer in International Law, University of Cambridge
73) Sergey Sayapin, Associate Professor of International and Criminal Law, School of Law, KIMEP University, Kazakhstan
74) Michael Schmitt, Professor of International Law at the University of Reading and Francis Lieber Distinguished Scholar at the United States Military Academy (West Point)
75) John Shattuck, Professor of Practice in Diplomacy, Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy, Tufts University; US Assistant Secretary of State for Democracy, Human Rights and Labor (1993-98); Ambassador to the Czech Republic (1998-2000); President Emeritus, Central European University
76) Alfred H.A. Soons, Professor emeritus of public international law, Utrecht University School of Law, The Netherlands
77) Carsten Stahn, Professor of International Criminal Law and Global Justice, Leiden Law School and Queen’s University Belfast
78) Elizabeth Stubbins Bates, Junior Research Fellow in Law, Merton College, Oxford; Early Career Fellow, Bonavero Institute of Human Rights, University of Oxford; Research Fellow, ELAC
79) Liis Vihul, Founder and CEO, Cyber Law International
80) Michael Waibel, Professor of International Law, University of Vienna, Austria
Oxford Statement on the International Law Protections against Cyber Operations Targeting the Health-Care Sector

81) Philippa Webb, Professor of Public International Law, King’s College London
82) Leah West, Lecturer, Norman Paterson School of International Affairs, Carleton University, Australia
83) Elizabeth Wilmshurst, Distinguished Fellow, International Law Programme, Chatham House (Royal Institute of International Affairs)